



Estyn

Rhagoriaeth i bawb - Excellence for all

Arolygiaeth Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg
a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru

Her Majesty's Inspectorate
for Education and Training in Wales

The Welsh Baccalaureate in key stage 4 An evaluation of the first eighteen months of the pilot to introduce Foundation and Intermediate Level Qualifications into key stage 4

May 2008



BUDDSODDWR MEWN POBL
INVESTOR IN PEOPLE



The purpose of Estyn is to inspect quality and standards in education and training in Wales. Estyn is responsible for inspecting:

- ▲ nursery schools and settings that are maintained by, or receive funding from, local authorities (LAs);
- ▲ primary schools;
- ▲ secondary schools;
- ▲ special schools;
- ▲ pupil referral units;
- ▲ independent schools;
- ▲ further education;
- ▲ adult community-based learning;
- ▲ youth support services;
- ▲ youth and community work training;
- ▲ LAs;
- ▲ teacher education and training;
- ▲ work-based learning;
- ▲ careers companies;
- ▲ offender learning; and
- ▲ the education, guidance and training elements of The Department for Work and Pensions funded training programmes.

Estyn also:

- ▲ provides advice on quality and standards in education and training in Wales to the National Assembly for Wales and others; and
- ▲ makes public good practice based on inspection evidence.

Every possible care has been taken to ensure that the information in this document is accurate at the time of going to press. Any enquiries or comments regarding this document/publication should be addressed to:

Publication Section

Estyn

Anchor Court

Keen Road

Cardiff

CF24 5JW or by email to publications@estyn.gsi.gov.uk

This and other Estyn publications are available on our website: www.estyn.gov.uk

© Crown Copyright 2008: This report may be re-used free of charge in any format or medium provided that it is re-used accurately and not used in a misleading context. The material must be acknowledged as Crown copyright and the title of the document/publication specified.

Contents	Page
Introduction	1
Purpose	1
Background	1
Main findings	4
Recommendations	7
How are schools delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate?	8
Curriculum planning for the Welsh Baccalaureate	8
Key skills	10
Wales, Europe and the World	11
Work-related education	12
Personal and social education	12
Individual Investigation	12
How well are schools teaching and assessing the Welsh Baccalaureate?	14
Teaching	14
Assessment	14
How well do schools support learners?	16
How effectively are leaders and managers introducing the Welsh Baccalaureate?	17
How well are learners doing?	19
Appendices	
The Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification	
Learning Core of Learning Pathways 14-19 at key stage 4	

Introduction

Purpose

- 1 This report focuses on the introduction of the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification at Foundation and Intermediate levels at key stage 4 in schools in Wales. It aims to provide a position paper that evaluates the Welsh Assembly Government pilot project to introduce the Welsh Baccalaureate into this key stage.
- 2 The report is based on visits to, and interviews with, a sample of secondary schools during autumn 2007 and spring 2008 to:
 - discuss the programme with learners, teachers, Welsh Baccalaureate co-ordinators and headteachers;
 - scrutinise learners' work and teachers' planning documents; and
 - observe relevant lessons and activities.
- 3 In 2008-2009, Estyn will carry out a linked survey of the delivery of key skills qualifications in key stage 4.

Background

- 4 The Welsh Assembly Government introduced a pilot project for the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification at Advanced and Intermediate levels in 2003 for post-16 learners. In October 2006, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills announced that there would be a planned, staged roll-out of the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification at Advanced and Intermediate levels at post-16 from September 2007. By September 2008, 79 schools, 17 further-education institutions and five work-based learning providers across Wales will be involved. This represents about half the schools in Wales that have sixth forms and about three-quarters of further-education institutions.
- 5 In September 2006 the Welsh Assembly Government introduced a pilot project for the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification at Intermediate and Foundation levels at key stage 4. The 21 schools involved are divided into two groups with one group starting to teach the Welsh Baccalaureate in September 2006 and the other group starting in September 2007. The course covers the two years of the key stage and the pilot is planned to finish in July 2009.
- 6 The Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification has developed in parallel with Welsh Assembly Government policy on Learning Pathways 14-19. This policy addresses the need for a more flexible and balanced approach to the education of 14 to 19 year olds, developing a range of relevant skills, and providing a wider range of experiences which will suit the diverse needs of young people in Wales.

- 7 The Welsh Baccalaureate Diploma is nationally approved and offered at Foundation (level 1), Intermediate (level 2) and Advanced (level 3) levels. WJEC is the examining board for the qualification.
- 8 The Welsh Baccalaureate programme consists of the **Core Studies** and **Options**. The components of the Core Studies are broken down further into constituent 'elements'¹. This report uses the terms 'elements' and 'components' in the way that it is illustrated below in the account of 'Core Studies'.

Core Studies	Options
<p>The four components of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • key skills; • Wales, Europe and the World (four elements and a language module); • work-related education (working with an employer and a team enterprise activity); and • personal and social education (five elements). <p>The learner must also complete an Individual Investigation at an appropriate level.</p>	<p>Courses that lead to external qualifications approved for use in Wales at the appropriate level, for example GCSE, AS or A levels, NVQ, or BTEC</p>

- 9 Learners can gain a Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification **Core Certificate** by achieving the requirements of the Core Studies. The core certificate contributes to the wider points score shown on schools' RE2 form². At Intermediate level this is worth 152.5 points which includes 106.5 points for the minimum key skills requirements for the Intermediate core. This is equivalent to approximately three grade As at GCSE. At Foundation level it is worth 100 points, including 75 points for the minimum key skills requirements for the Foundation core. This is equivalent to approximately three grade Ds at GCSE. However, the core certificate does not currently contribute to the Level 1 or Level 2 Threshold indicator³ or to headline indicators such as the five or more GCSEs or equivalent at grades A* to C or A* to G.
- 10 The **Welsh Baccalaureate Diploma** will be awarded to candidates who attain the Core Certificate and option qualifications at the appropriate level. For example, the level 1 Welsh Baccalaureate Foundation Diploma will be awarded to candidates who

¹ Appendix 1 provides more details about the structure of the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification.

² The RE2 form contains summary examination information, specific to each school, compiled by the WJEC on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government.

³ The Level 2 Threshold indicator is shown on the RE2 form for 2007 as a pilot indicator with the intention that it will be implemented from 2008. The Level 2 Threshold indicator is a measure of the volume of qualifications at level 2 that is equivalent to the volume of 5 GCSEs at grades A* to C.

attain the Foundation Core Certificate, together with an NVQ level 1 or equivalent, or a minimum of four grades D to G at GCSE, or their equivalent.

- 11 All learners at key stage 4 must follow the National Curriculum programmes of study for English, Welsh (where appropriate), mathematics, science and physical education. In addition to these subjects, they must also follow the basic curriculum that includes religious education, work-related education, careers education and guidance, personal and social education and sex education.
- 12 One of the six elements of Learning Pathways 14-19 is the Learning Core. This sets out the skills, knowledge, understanding, attitudes and values, and common experiences for all learners, irrespective of the options they have chosen as part of their Learning Pathway. There is further information on the Learning Core at key stage 4 in Appendix 2.
- 13 Twenty-one schools are teaching the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 as part of the pilot. Ten started in September 2006 and the rest in September 2007. Of the 21 schools, 11 were involved with the Advanced and Intermediate level pilot project at post-16 and four others joined the Advanced and Intermediate level roll-out programme in September 2007. The remaining seven schools are not involved in the Advanced and Intermediate roll-out programme.
- 14 Of the 21 schools involved in Welsh Baccalaureate programme at key stage 4:
 - six schools teach the programme to all key stage 4 learners at Foundation or Intermediate levels;
 - eight schools teach the programme at Foundation and Intermediate levels to a selected number of learners, with number ranges from 19 learners in one school to 100 in another; and
 - seven schools teach the programme to a selected group of learners at Foundation level only, with numbers ranging from 12 in one school to 103 in another.
- 15 Nearly three-quarters of the learners across all pilot schools are taking the Intermediate qualification. Overall, about 2,300 learners are following the programme in key stage 4, representing about 2% of the total learners at this key stage.

Main findings

Delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate

- 16 Schools delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate at post-16 view its introduction at key stage 4 to be much less complicated than at post-16. The schools that teach the Welsh Baccalaureate to all learners in key stage 4 find it more straightforward than those schools that teach it to selected groups and generally have more success in planning because they can do so across the whole cohort.
- 17 Many schools follow essentially the same basic pattern for delivering the Core Studies part of the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4:
 - the main content is taught in timetabled lessons that are usually allocated to personal and social education, work-related education and careers education and guidance;
 - this is supplemented by a tutor period – usually an extended registration period, but occasionally additional timetabled lessons or special day-long events are also used; and
 - the content is delivered mainly by a dedicated team of ‘specialist’ teachers rather than by form tutors.
- 18 The schools where the planning for the Welsh Baccalaureate is effective see the programme as a means to meet other curricular requirements, such as that of the 14-19 Learning Core, rather than an additional burden. They have analysed carefully what they do already and what they need to do to meet the demands of the programme. In these schools, learners see the programme as a normal part of their curriculum.
- 19 Although the qualification is included in the wider points score, the fact that it does not contribute to headline performance indicators such as five or more GCSEs at grades A* to C is a major barrier to its expansion at key stage 4.
- 20 The co-ordination and organisation of the key skills component are crucial to the successful delivery of the Welsh Baccalaureate. Successful delivery is always based on careful mapping to check that there is full coverage of the key skills and diligent monitoring to ensure that they are being delivered.
- 21 Many schools deliver most of the key skills of communication and application of number through English or Welsh and mathematics subject work respectively. This provision is supplemented by work in other subjects across the curriculum. Most schools are developing effective arrangements for planning, co-ordinating and assessing portfolios in these key skills. Most schools deliver most of the key skill of information and communications technology (ICT) through information technology (IT) as a subject and take advantage of the exemption that allows attainment of the GCSE or equivalent in IT to be a proxy for the key skill qualification.

- 22 Many schools plan well for the delivery of the wider key skills of problem solving, working with others and improving own learning and performance. In the best schools, the work for these skills is carefully co-ordinated and monitored.
- 23 With some minor adjustments, schools are finding it straightforward to accommodate Wales, Europe and the World and personal and social education into their existing curriculum structures in key stage 4. All schools deliver the language module through existing provision, mainly in Welsh or, in a few instances, modern foreign languages. Schools generally cover Wales, Europe and World and personal and social education well, although the community participation element is not fully covered in all schools.
- 24 In work-related education, schools already have the mechanism to deliver the element of working with employers through its existing provision for work experience and associated activities. The enterprise activity is based either on a dedicated unit of work in the timetabled Welsh Baccalaureate lessons or delivered on a specific day, such as an 'enterprise day' or 'industry day'.
- 25 Most schools link the individual investigation to the work being undertaken in the Core Studies, especially that on Wales, Europe and the World.

Teaching, assessment and support for learners

- 26 In most of the schools visited for the survey, the teaching of the Welsh Baccalaureate is good overall, but only in a few of the classes, where levels 1 and 2 are mixed, do teachers plan well enough to meet the needs of learners of different abilities.
- 27 Most schools have devised appropriate systems for monitoring and tracking learners' progress through the Baccalaureate programme. However, only a few schools at this stage have effective systems to ensure the standard of work for a particular element of the qualification is appropriate for its level. There is some variability in the practices of visiting WJEC moderators.
- 28 In general, individual support for learners on the Welsh Baccalaureate is good. Most learners receive helpful advice, guidance and support. However, there is considerable variation in the way schools organise the personal tutorial system at key stage 4. Tutor groups are too large to be effective in a few schools.

Leadership and management

- 29 Most schools are managing the introduction of the Welsh Baccalaureate well. However, at this stage, only a few schools have set clear targets for pupil attainment in the qualification. In general, where a school has a large number of learners taking the programme, the headteacher, senior managers and governing body are closely involved in its introduction. Many schools have a senior member of staff responsible for co-ordinating the work of the team of teachers involved in delivering the programme. Where this is the case, and when teams meet regularly to plan and modify provision, the Welsh Baccalaureate is more likely to succeed.

- 30 In a few schools, there are no regular scheduled planning and evaluation meetings for the Welsh Baccalaureate. This lack of systematic co-ordination and evaluation has a detrimental effect on the quality of provision.
- 31 The monies schools receive to introduce the Welsh Baccalaureate are generally used well, but schools have concerns about whether they can sustain the programme once the additional funding ceases. Few schools have evaluated in any detail the other costs associated with introducing the Welsh Baccalaureate.

Learner outcomes and achievements

- 32 The Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 is at an early stage of development and the first group of learners will not complete the course until the end of the 2007-2008 academic year. At present there are no results to show learners' attainments.
- 33 In the classes observed during the visits to schools, most learners achieve generally good standards in the work they are producing. They are making good progress in developing communication, application of number and ICT key skills for their level of study. Learners generally achieve good standards in personal and social education and in their work on Wales, Europe and the World.
- 34 In work-related education, most learners work with employers effectively and many also contribute well the team enterprise activity. However, in a minority of schools, learners' work on the team enterprise activity is not as good as their work with an employer.
- 35 Those learners who have completed their individual investigation have produced work of a good standard. Nearly all schools produce the individual investigation exclusively for the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification and they do not use coursework that has been produced for other examinations such as GCSE. However, a few investigations are based too closely on coursework produced in GCSE subjects such as science.

Recommendations

36 In order to further implement the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4:

schools should:

- R1 ensure that senior managers play a key role in leading and co-ordinating the development of the programme in their schools;
- R2 provide sufficient planning and evaluation time for the team delivering the programme;
- R3 establish manageable systems to moderate the standards being achieved for assessment purposes;
- R4 set up comprehensive and workable systems to plan, map and monitor the delivery of key skills; and
- R5 organise tutor groups of a reasonable size so that personal tutors can fulfil their role; and

WJEC should:

- R6 provide further guidance and training for teachers on the standards of work expected at levels 1 and 2; and
- R7 continue work to improve the reliability and consistency of assessments at all levels through improved moderation arrangements.

How are schools delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate?

Curriculum planning for the Welsh Baccalaureate

- 37 Schools that deliver the Welsh Baccalaureate to all learners, and the minority of the schools that deliver it only to a selected number of learners, follow essentially the same basic pattern of delivery. The pattern has three main features:
- the main content, which is taught in timetabled lessons that are usually allocated to personal and social education, work-related education and careers education and guidance;
 - a tutor period, which is usually an extended registration period, but can consist of additional timetabled lessons or special day-long events; and
 - delivery which is mainly by a dedicated team of 'specialist' teachers rather than by form tutors.
- 38 As result of this pattern, the delivery of Welsh Baccalaureate in these schools does not impact on their option schemes.
- 39 Schools see the requirements of the Welsh Baccalaureate as fitting closely with the statutory requirements for key stage 4, particularly those for personal and social education, work-related education and careers education and guidance and the National Curriculum core subjects. They also see a close fit to the minimum requirements and enhancements of the Learning Core⁴ in Learning Pathways 14-19 and use the Welsh Baccalaureate as a mechanism for delivering the Learning Core. Most of these schools have carefully mapped the requirements of the programme, the statutory requirements for key stage 4 and the Learning Core, and planned a programme that meets all of them. For example, one school has devised a scheme of work that contains units of work on:
- health and relationships;
 - moral and spiritual development;
 - active citizenship;
 - environmental awareness;
 - lifelong learning; and
 - local and global awareness in Year 10 and community participation in Year 11.
- 40 Schools that have experience of delivering the programme at post-16 view its introduction at key stage 4 as much more straightforward than at post-16. This is

⁴ See Appendix 2 for details of the Learning Core in Learning Pathways 14-19.

because the key stage 4 curriculum is already planned with designated time for delivering common experiences for the whole cohort. The requirements for the Welsh Baccalaureate can fit into this designated time with no direct impact on options or option schemes. All schools already:

- teach personal and social education, work-related education, careers education and guidance, ICT and a language;
- have a timetabled lesson available for teaching most of these;
- have a tutor system in place; and
- seek to meet statutory requirements and are planning to introduce the Learning Core of Learning Pathways 14-19.

- 41 This basic pattern is also supplemented by the use of other curriculum time. This mostly involves compulsory subjects such as English or Welsh to support the teaching of communication and mathematics to support the teaching of application of number. In addition, compulsory IT or Welsh as a second language are used to teach the ICT component and the language module respectively. Beyond these common contributions, other subjects also make a contribution. For example, in one school the key skill of working with others is assessed in science lessons.
- 42 Schools that teach the Welsh Baccalaureate to the whole cohort usually teach all learners in mixed-ability groups and do not decide who will be entered for the Foundation or Intermediate awards until they have a clear idea of the potential of learners.
- 43 Where there are variations to this basic model of delivery, it is in the schools that are currently teaching the Welsh Baccalaureate to a selected number of learners. In these cases, the school still uses the timetabled lesson for all learners for personal and social education and work-related education, but also provides learners with the opportunity to select the Welsh Baccalaureate in their option choices. In these models, learners usually take the Welsh Baccalaureate alongside another course in the option scheme, for example as part of the physical education GCSE curriculum or of a BTEC course. In those schools providing the programme at Foundation level only, it is usually delivered to less able or disaffected learners either as an option itself or as part of an overall programme specifically designed for these learners. The programme sometimes includes work placements.
- 44 Most of the schools that are delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate to a selected number intend to roll it out to all learners. They are using their experiences of teaching the Welsh Baccalaureate to these groups as a mechanism for trying out arrangements before making it available to all learners. A few schools that only offer it at Foundation level see the programme as being a suitable vehicle for providing a range of courses to this group of learners. Many of these schools have yet to decide whether to make the Welsh Baccalaureate available to all learners in the key stage.

- 45 Where the curriculum planning for the Welsh Baccalaureate is effective:
- managers see the Welsh Baccalaureate as an effective means to meet curricular requirements, such as the basic curriculum and the Learning Core, and do not see it as an additional burden;
 - there is careful analysis of what the school does already and what it needs to do to meet the demands of the programme; and
 - learners see the Welsh Baccalaureate as a normal part of their curriculum.
- 46 Although the Welsh Baccalaureate contributes to the wider points score shown on the RE2 form, schools are concerned that it will not feature in headline performance indicators such as the Level 2 Threshold Indicator or five or more GCSEs at grades A* to C. These latter indicators are the ones that attract most attention from parents and the media, and the fact that the qualification does not count towards them is a major stumbling block to its further expansion at key stage 4.

Key skills

- 47 Nearly all the schools that deliver the Welsh Baccalaureate to the whole cohort and many of those delivering it to selected groups use English or Welsh and mathematics lessons to deliver most of the key skills of communication and application of number respectively. In these subjects, teachers make some adjustments to their teaching programme in order to accommodate the demands of the key skills qualification. In most cases this results in devising a designated task or series of tasks. These schools make the English or Welsh and mathematics departments accountable for the delivery and assessment of the two main key skills courses. In the most effective schools, members of these departments have been given teaching and learning responsibilities specifically for this work.
- 48 In most schools, work on communication and application of number is further supplemented by work in other parts of the curriculum. For example for the key skill of communication, contributions can come from careers education and religious education or history. However, responsibility for planning, co-ordination and assessment remains with the co-ordinator for the key skill, who is generally the English, Welsh or mathematics teacher concerned.
- 49 In some of the schools delivering the Welsh Baccalaureate to a selected group, the teaching of communication and application of number is carried out by the team teaching the programme, for example either as an aspect within the common curriculum time provided for all learners or in the particular option selected by learners.
- 50 Most schools teach ICT through their IT provision for all learners and take advantage of the exemption that allows attainment of the GCSE or equivalent in IT to be a proxy for the key skill. Most schools also supplement this provision with further work across the curriculum, but this is not as tightly monitored or tracked as well that for communication and application of number.

- 51 A few schools offer the key skills of communication, application of number and ICT in Year 9 and enter learners for the level 1 qualification at the end of that year. Most learners then progress onto the level 2 qualification in key stage 4. This is an effective strategy.
- 52 Many schools also plan well for the delivery of the wider key skills of problem solving, working with others and improving own learning and performance. In the best cases, the work for these skills is carefully co-ordinated and monitored.
- 53 Problem solving in some schools is allocated to the science department in order to capitalise on learners' work in investigating science. Because science is a core subject at key stage 4, this has the advantage that all learners will take it. In other schools, it is allocated to other departments, for example to physical education or Welsh as a second language, or to activities such as work experience where learners have to research and find their own placements. These parts of the curriculum are also common for all of the key stage 4 cohort.
- 54 Most schools use specific activities to deliver the key skill of working with others. For example, many schools make use of the team enterprise activity in the work-related education component of the Welsh Baccalaureate, while others exploit the production of group presentations as part of the community participation element of personal and social education.
- 55 Nearly all schools plan to deliver the key skill of improving own learning and performance through the personal tutor system, often in extended registration periods where they focus on developing the learners' individual action plan.
- 56 Whereas planning for most aspects of the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 is relatively straightforward, the co-ordination and organisation of the key skills component are crucial to its successful delivery. The content components of the Core Studies of the programme match many existing requirements, for example those for personal and social education, work-related education and careers education and guidance, but those for delivering the key skills often need adjustments to existing programmes in subjects such as English, Welsh and mathematics. Successful delivery is always based on careful mapping to check that there is full coverage of the key skills and diligent monitoring to ensure that they are being delivered.

Wales, Europe and the World

- 57 Schools accommodate Wales, Europe and the World easily within their existing curriculum structures in key stage 4. Most schools make this one of the main focuses of a designated weekly timetabled lesson, along with personal and social education. They usually supplement it with visits and visiting speakers, and often link it to the individual investigation.
- 58 In most cases, this component is taught by the Welsh Baccalaureate team, but in a few schools it is taught by other specialist teachers such as those in the Welsh and geography departments.

- 59 In a few schools, where selected groups only are following the Welsh Baccalaureate, the component is taught in the specific lessons allocated to the Welsh Baccalaureate. For example, this happens in physical education lessons in the one school where the component is delivered in this optional subject.
- 60 All schools deliver the language module through their existing provision for Welsh or Welsh as a second language and, in a few instances, modern foreign languages. As with ICT, schools claim work in these languages as a proxy for the language module.

Work-related education

- 61 Schools already have the mechanism to deliver the element of working with employers through its provision for work experience and associated activities. In most cases, only a few minor adjustments to existing arrangements were needed to ensure that all Welsh Baccalaureate requirements were met, for example in meeting the need to investigate the job opportunities in the learners' locality. The additional aspects were provided through the single lesson that is usually earmarked on the timetable.
- 62 The team enterprise activity is based either on a dedicated unit of work in the timetabled Welsh Baccalaureate lessons or through a specific day, such as an 'enterprise day' or 'industry day'. In a few instances, schools combine both approaches. The most successful examples are based on a unit of work so that learners had sufficient time to work on a project in some depth. For example, in one school, learners organised a Christmas fair for pupils in Year 7 and Year 8. In cases such as these, the more substantial activity presents opportunities for learners also to develop the key skills of working with others and problem solving.

Personal and social education

- 63 Along with the Wales, Europe and the World component, this is the simplest component to deliver. All schools have an existing timetabled lesson(s) in their common curriculum for all learners for personal and social education and, once schools have matched the requirements of the Welsh Baccalaureate to those of the personal and social education framework, they deliver this component in this way.
- 64 Schools generally cover the elements well, although the community participation element is not fully covered in all schools. The schools that deal successfully with this requirement use the activity to provide further opportunities to teach the key skills of working with others and problem solving.

Individual investigation

- 65 Most schools link the individual investigation to the work being undertaken in the timetabled lesson(s) in the Core Studies, especially to the work on Wales, Europe and the World. A few schools delegate the investigation to a particular subject in the National Curriculum core such as English, Welsh or science. In nearly all schools there is a designated number of lessons which allow learners to complete the investigation in class. One school arranges for every subject, whether in the common curriculum for all learners or in the options, to offer a number of titles for

learners to choose from. It organises this carefully by providing a template for each subject to set out its offer and by monitoring learners' choice of topic and their progress in completing it. In another school, teachers who deliver the Welsh Baccalaureate to a group of less able and potentially disaffected pupils find it difficult to deliver this component of the programme, mainly because learners are not given enough time to complete the investigation.

- 66 Nearly all schools produce the individual investigation exclusively for the Welsh Baccalaureate and they do not use coursework that has been produced for other examinations such as GCSE. However, there are exceptions where a school is teaching the Welsh Baccalaureate as part of an optional subject to a limited number of learners. This practice is acceptable as long as the different criteria for both GCSE and the Welsh Baccalaureate are met. This is possible with some subjects, for example in geography or sociology, but in most cases it is difficult to achieve.

How well are schools teaching and assessing the Welsh Baccalaureate?

Teaching

- 67 In most of the schools visited for the survey, the teaching of the Welsh Baccalaureate is good. Sessions are planned effectively for the most part, and teachers often develop innovative and interesting activities for learners. Most teachers involved in teaching the programme are knowledgeable about its demands, committed and enthusiastic.
- 68 There are many examples of innovative approaches. Teachers introduce strategies and activities that they have not used before, including more group work, greater use of ICT, visits to places of interest, and the use of comparison and contrast to reinforce learning. Visits to places such as the Senedd building and the Westminster Parliament are often used to inform learners about the democratic process. Most schools organise stimulating visiting speakers for aspects of the Core Studies.
- 69 Teachers plan well enough to meet the needs of most learners of different abilities, but in some cases teachers do not receive enough guidance from managers on the suitability of the materials they are preparing for learners and fail to produce materials that engage learners fully.
- 70 Where less able pupils who are aiming to complete the Foundation level qualification attend common sessions with pupils who are aiming for the Intermediate level qualification, there is not enough differentiation of tasks and activities to sustain their interest and motivation.

Assessment

- 71 Most schools have devised appropriate systems for monitoring and tracking learners' progress through the programme. Teachers in the most effective systems are clear about what needs to be recorded and how. Information is collected and collated in a manageable and systematic way. The best systems use simple recording sheets that all staff involved can understand and use with a minimum of fuss. The Welsh Baccalaureate co-ordinator is at the heart of such systems and the best schools use the information they collect to feed back progress to senior managers and pastoral leaders, such as heads of year, as well as to the team of teachers. Experience of monitoring and tracking learners' progress through the Welsh Baccalaureate at post-16 has proved to be particularly useful when devising systems for learners in key stage 4. In many cases, schools make good use of administrative staff to support the system.
- 72 Only a few schools at this stage have effective systems to ensure the standard of work for a particular element of the Welsh Baccalaureate is appropriate for a level 1 or a level 2 performance. There is some variability in the practices of visiting WJEC moderators. Some moderators look at a sample of learners' work and check to ensure that the required forms have been completed accurately. However, other

moderators only check to ensure that the form has been completed and do not scrutinise learners' work to ensure that the school-based assessments are rigorous, valid and reliable. WJEC is working to ensure that moderation becomes more consistent and rigorous.

- 73 A minority of schools have still not set up tracking systems to monitor the progress of learners through the programme.

How well do schools support learners?

- 74 In general, the individual support for learners on the Welsh Baccalaureate is good. Most learners received helpful advice, guidance and support before starting on the programme. In most cases, schools marketed the qualification effectively to learners and parents, and included helpful information about the programme in option choice guidance booklets for Year 9 learners. Most learners have a good understanding of what they need to do in order to gain the Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification.
- 75 Individual personal support for learners on a one-to-one basis is a key element of the Welsh Baccalaureate. The personal tutor acts as a mediator between the learners and the demands of the course. However, there is considerable variation in the way schools organise the personal tutorial system at key stage 4. For example, in one school, learners are divided into manageable groups of between 12 and 16 and their tutor sees them every day. This is an effective arrangement and ensures that learners get very good support for their work. By contrast, another school has one tutor for a group of 30 learners and this arrangement does not allow the tutor to provide the support that is needed.

How effectively are leaders and managers introducing the Welsh Bacallaureate?

- 76 Most schools are managing the introduction of the Welsh Bacallaureate well. The Welsh Bacallaureate has a clear place in strategic plans and the process of introducing it is being organised carefully and purposefully. However, at this stage, only a few schools have set clear targets for pupil attainment in the qualification.
- 77 Schools are already carrying out work that is similar to many aspects of the Welsh Bacallaureate at key stage 4. Schools are delivering statutory requirements such as the National Curriculum and basic curriculum. National Curriculum subjects are useful as they can either become vehicles for some requirements, such as those concerned with the key skills of communication and application of number, or act as proxy qualifications, for example Welsh and IT. The requirements to teach personal and social education, work-related education and careers education and guidance are also integral parts of the Core Studies of the Welsh Bacallaureate. As schools look to implement the Learning Pathways 14-19 initiative, particularly the Learning Core, Personal Support and Learning Coach elements, they can see that the Welsh Bacallaureate offers a mechanism for doing so. These factors make the implementation of the Welsh Bacallaureate at key stage 4 relatively straightforward, especially where schools have introduced it for the whole cohort.
- 78 In general, where a school has a large number of learners taking the Welsh Bacallaureate, the headteacher, senior managers and governing body are closely involved in its introduction. In some cases in the early stages of its introduction, the headteacher is a member of the team implementing the programme and either teaches an aspect of the course or takes responsibility for a tutor group. Successful schools have a senior member of staff responsible for co-ordinating the work of the team of teachers involved in delivering the Welsh Bacallaureate. The team meets regularly to plan, implement, evaluate and modify arrangements in the light of their experience. This is a key factor in successfully developing the implementation of this new programme.
- 79 Most schools have not needed to change their existing management structures and procedures when introducing the Welsh Bacallaureate. Instead they have adapted them to accommodate the new demands. Roles and responsibilities for leading and managing the Welsh Bacallaureate are generally clear and effective, and fit in well with other roles and responsibilities within the school. Overall, schools that are teaching the Welsh Bacallaureate to all learners in key stage 4 are finding the introduction and organisation of the programme to be more straightforward than those schools that are teaching it to selected groups. Planning is generally successful when the whole cohort is involved.
- 80 Successful schools have usually appointed an additional full-time or part-time administrative assistant to help with the heavy administrative burden that falls on teachers in relation to this programme. This allows teachers to be released for their main role of planning and teaching effectively.

- 81 Where possible, schools have made very good use of their experiences of implementing the qualification at post-16. In these cases, they have a secure understanding of the demands of the programme and have already introduced the procedures needed to manage the programme successfully. In the minority of cases where schools are introducing the Welsh Baccalaureate for the first time there are inevitably a few teething problems. For example, in one school, teachers responsible for the programme were planning their work for the Foundation level qualification, while some members of the senior management team believed that pupils were working towards the Intermediate level qualification.
- 82 In a few schools, there are no regular scheduled planning and evaluation meetings for the Welsh Baccalaureate. This lack of systematic co-ordination and evaluation has a detrimental effect on the quality.
- 83 Pilot schools receive funding⁵ for each learner entered for the qualification at key stage 4. These monies are well used in general to pay for administrative support, pupil stationery, visits, and the additional costs of work experience and community work. However, few schools have evaluated in detail the other costs of introducing the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 such as staffing costs. Most schools believe that learners are gaining a great deal of value from Welsh Baccalaureate, but they have concerns about whether they can sustain the provision once the additional funding ceases.
- 84 The key success factors in implementing the Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 are:
- ensuring strong and purposeful leadership from senior managers, including their involvement at some level within its delivery;
 - using the Welsh Baccalaureate as a mechanism for delivering the statutory requirements and the 14-19 Learning Core at key stage 4;
 - training a well-organised team to deliver the programme;
 - introducing efficient and manageable systems for tracking and monitoring learners' experiences and progress; and
 - planning an effective tutorial system.

⁵ Schools receive formula-based financial support during their involvement in the pilot which equates to about £165 for each learner in each year of their involvement in the pilot.

How well are learners doing?

- 85 The Welsh Baccalaureate at key stage 4 is at an early stage of development and the first group of learners will not complete the course until the end of the 2007-2008 academic year. At present there are no results to show learners' attainments.
- 86 In the classes observed during the visits to schools, most learners achieve generally good standards in the work they are producing. They are making good progress in developing communication, application of number and ICT key skills for their level of study. Most learners find the work interesting and their teachers believe that it is having a positive effect on learners' attitudes to work and their attendance rates.
- 87 Through their study of Wales, Europe and the World, most learners gain a good understanding of contemporary issues as they affect Wales and other countries. Also in the different elements of personal and social education, most learners are acquiring a good knowledge and understanding and developing suitable skills. In work-related education, most learners are developing the skills necessary for achieving the requirements of the element of working with employers, particularly through the completion of their work-experience placement. Through the team enterprise activity, many learners are also acquiring useful knowledge and skills about business and enterprise. In completing their enterprise activity, they also develop the wider key skills of working with others and problem solving. However, in a minority of schools, learners' work on the team enterprise activity is not as good as their work with an employer. In a few cases, learners do not work well as a team and do not achieve the aims of the activity.
- 88 Those learners who have completed their individual investigation have produced work of a good standard. They have produced interesting work, particularly where they compare an issue in Wales with a similar issue in a different country. Although most schools do not use coursework that has been produced for other examinations, a few investigations are based too closely on coursework produced in GCSE subjects such as science.

Appendix 1: The Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification

The Welsh Baccalaureate consists of two main parts, **Core Studies** and **Options**.

Core Studies

Core Studies has four components:

1 the six **key skills** of:

- communication;
- application of number;
- information technology;
- improving own learning and performance;
- working with others; and
- problem solving.

Learners must provide a portfolio of evidence for assessment for key skills.

2 **Wales, Europe and the World**

- politics;
- social issues;
- economic and technological issues; and
- cultural issues.

Learners also have to study a language module as part of this component.

3 **Work-related education**

- working with an employer; and
- team enterprise activity.

4 **Personal and social education**

- positive relationships;
- health and emotional well-being;

- active citizenship;
- sustainable development and global citizenship; and
- community participation.

Learners must also complete an **Individual Investigation** at an appropriate level. This gives them an opportunity to carry out a research project into an area of interest from the Core Studies or Options and develops skills in collecting, analysing and presenting information.

Learners can gain a **Core Certificate** for achieving the requirements of the Core Studies.

Options

The second part is the **Options** which include courses leading to external qualifications approved for use in Wales at GCSE, A level, NVQ, BTEC or equivalent.

Qualifications

Together, the **Core Studies** and **Options** make up the **Welsh Baccalaureate Diploma**. The Welsh Baccalaureate Diploma is nationally approved and offered at Foundation, Intermediate or Advanced Level.

The Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification is designed to fit in with statutory requirements at key stage 4 and to help learners to progress, as appropriate, to the intermediate or advanced diploma and post-16 study.

The **Level 1 Welsh Baccalaureate Foundation Diploma** will be awarded to candidates who attain the Foundation Core Certificate, together with an NVQ level 1 or equivalent, or a minimum of four grades D to G at GCSE, or their equivalent. The Foundation Core Certificate requires learners to:

- attain key skills certification in four of the six areas at level 1, including one of communication, application of number and ICT;
- attain level 1 in the Individual Investigation; and
- show satisfactory completion of the curriculum requirements of the Core Studies components.

The **Level 2 Welsh Baccalaureate Intermediate Diploma** will be awarded to candidates who attain the Intermediate Core Certificate, together with an NVQ level 2 or equivalent, or a minimum of four grades A* to C at GCSE, or their equivalent. Intermediate Core Certificate requires learners to:

- attain certification in four key skills, two at level 2 and two at level 1, including communication, application of number and ICT. There must be evidence of having pursued all six key skills;
- attain level 2 for an individual investigation; and

- show satisfactory completion of the curriculum requirements of the Core Studies components.

Learners who do not complete all of the requirements for the award of the full Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification Diploma can nevertheless achieve recognised qualifications in their optional studies and the Key Skills Qualifications.

Summary of Welsh Baccalaureate Qualification requirements at each level
--

	Core Studies	Options
<p>Welsh Baccalaureate Foundation Diploma (National Qualifications Framework level 1) Available pre-16 and post-16</p>	<p>Core Certificate at level 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four Key Skills at level 1, which must include one from communication, application of number and ICT, and evidence of having pursued all six Key Skills • Verification and evaluation reports for Working with an Employer, Team Enterprise activity and Community Participation • Individual Investigation at level 1 • Specified curriculum requirements 	<p>Four grades D-G at GCSE or equivalent, e.g. NVQ level 1, BTEC Introductory Diploma</p>
<p>Welsh Baccalaureate Intermediate Diploma (National Qualifications Framework level 2) Available pre-16 and post-16</p>	<p>Core Certificate at level 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four Key Skills, including communication, application of number and ICT. At least two to be achieved at level 2 and two at level 1. There must be evidence of having pursued all six Key Skills. • Verification and evaluation reports for Working with an Employer, Team Enterprise activity and Community Participation • Individual Investigation at level 2 • Specified curriculum requirements 	<p>Four grades A*-C at GCSE or equivalent, e.g. NVQ level 2, BTEC First at pass level (6 units)</p>
<p>Welsh Baccalaureate Advanced Diploma (National Qualifications Framework level 3) Available post-16</p>	<p>Core Certificate at level 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Three Key Skills at level 3, one of which must be from communication, application of number and ICT, together with the other Key Skills at level 2 • Verification and evaluation reports for Working with an Employer, Team Enterprise activity and Community Participation • Individual Investigation at level 3 • Specified curriculum requirements 	<p>Two GCE A level grades A-E or equivalent, e.g. NVQ level 3, BTEC National Certificate (12 units)</p>

Appendix 2: Learning Core of Learning Pathways 14-19 at key stage 4

Aspect	Minimum requirement	Enhancement
<p>Skills</p> <p>Key skills</p> <p>Welsh language skills</p> <p>Other work-related skills</p>	<p>All 14-16-year-olds should develop all six Key Skills (or follow appropriate entry/pre-entry level programmes for learners working below Level 1 in the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) at the level appropriate to their programmes.</p> <p>All 14-16-year-olds should be taught Welsh/Welsh Second Language as part of the National Curriculum requirements.</p> <p>All 14-19 learners should develop skills relevant to the workplace. ACCAC's frameworks for careers education and guidance and work-related education set out the minimum, including entrepreneurship, for full-time learners in schools.</p>	
<p>Knowledge and understanding</p> <p>Wales, Europe & the World</p> <p>Personal, social, sustainability and health matters</p> <p>Careers education/guidance</p>	<p>All 14-16-year-olds should be taught the Curriculum Cymreig/Wales, Europe and the World as part of the revised requirements for key stage 4.</p> <p>All 14-16-year-olds should be taught personal, social, sustainability and health matters based on the ACCAC framework.</p> <p>It is a statutory requirement on schools in Wales to provide a programme of careers education and guidance for all their full and part-time learners 13-19. The ACCAC careers framework provides clear guidance on what should be provided.</p>	

<p>Attitudes and values</p> <p>Respect for self, others and for diversity Responsibility for personal and social development, sustainability and health</p>	<p>Progressive development of these values should be a requirement for all learners 14-19. They are critical to the development of the whole person. Learning providers would need to determine the mechanisms that would enable individual learners to integrate their learning experiences and set goals for personal development.</p>	
<p>Common experiences</p> <p>Work-focused experience</p> <p>Community participation opportunities</p> <p>Cultural/sporting/aesthetic/creative experiences</p>	<p>Work-focused experience is a requirement for all 14-19 learners. For learners in schools and colleges, the minimum requirement should be based on the ACCAC work-related education framework.</p> <p>These should be voluntary activities so are not included as minimum requirements.</p> <p>All 14-16-year-olds should be taught physical education as part of the National Curriculum requirements.</p>	<p>Many learners should have opportunities for extended relevant work focused experience above the minimum required for work-related education. This might include recognition of part-time employment.</p> <p>All learners 14-19 should have access to this as an enhancement.</p> <p>All learners 14-19 should have access to cultural/sporting/aesthetic/creative experiences.</p>