
Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching and learning in further education

June 2017



The purpose of Estyn is to inspect quality and standards in education and training in Wales. Estyn is responsible for inspecting:

- ▲ nursery schools and settings that are maintained by, or receive funding from, local authorities (LAs)
- ▲ primary schools
- ▲ secondary schools
- ▲ all age schools
- ▲ special schools
- ▲ pupil referral units
- ▲ independent schools
- ▲ further education
- ▲ independent specialist colleges
- ▲ adult community learning
- ▲ local authority education services for children and young people
- ▲ teacher education and training
- ▲ Welsh for adults
- ▲ work-based learning
- ▲ learning in the justice sector

Estyn also:

- ▲ provides advice on quality and standards in education and training in Wales to the National Assembly for Wales and others
- ▲ makes public good practice based on inspection evidence

Every possible care has been taken to ensure that the information in this document is accurate at the time of going to press. Any enquiries or comments regarding this document/publication should be addressed to:

Publication Section

Estyn

Anchor Court

Keen Road

Cardiff

CF24 5JW or by e-mail to publications@estyn.gov.wales

This and other Estyn publications are available on our website: www.estyn.gov.wales

© Crown Copyright 2017: This report may be re-used free of charge in any format or medium provided that it is re-used accurately and not used in a misleading context. The material must be acknowledged as Crown copyright and the title of the report specified.

Content	Page
Introduction	1
Background	1
Main findings	3
Recommendations	6
Continuity and progression in Welsh-medium and bilingual learning experiences	7
Standards	10
Teaching and assessment	11
Leadership	12
Staffing and training	13
Support and guidance	14
Appendix 1: Evidence base	16
Appendix 2: Data evidence	17
References	20

Introduction

This report is written in response to a request for advice from the Welsh Government in the Minister's annual remit letter to Estyn for 2014-2015. The purpose of the report is to:

- examine how effectively further education colleges ensure continuity and progression in learning experiences through the medium of Welsh and bilingually
- evaluate the effectiveness of curricular models and teaching methods that are in place in further education colleges
- identify and share good practice in Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching

Background

From the 2011 census, 19% of the population in Wales speak Welsh. There are 20% of school-age pupils who study Welsh as a first language and 20% of sixth form learning experiences are studied in Welsh or bilingually. Only 10% of learners in further education colleges identify themselves as Welsh speakers and about 7% of learning experiences are studied in Welsh or bilingually.

In April 2010, the Welsh Government published its '*Welsh-medium Education Strategy*', which sets out the vision of continuing growth of Welsh-medium education and training in all sectors and age ranges. The strategy has six aims, of which two are directly relevant to further education colleges. Strategic aim 2 has the purpose to:

"...improve the planning of Welsh-medium provision in the post-14 phases of education and training, to take account of linguistic progression and continued development of skills" (p.14).

Strategic aim 3 has the purpose to:

"...ensure that all learners develop their Welsh-language skills to their full potential and encourage sound linguistic progression from one phase of education and training to the next" (p. 15).

In order to monitor progress in implementing the Strategy, the Welsh Government set fixed five-year and indicative ten-year targets based on outcomes that are central to its success. Of most relevance to the further education sector is outcome 4 of the strategy, which sets targets so that:

"more learners aged 16-19 study subjects through the medium of Welsh" (p.25).

The broad target is that, by 2020, at least 10% of learners in the further education sector study either through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

Further details can be found in Appendix 2, with Table 1 showing the All-Wales targets for increasing the number of learners aged 16-19 who study subjects through the medium of Welsh in schools, colleges and work-based learning. Table 3, also in Appendix 2, shows the distribution of Welsh speakers in Wales and statutory school aged pupils who are educated through the medium of Welsh by local authority.

Main findings

Continuity and progression in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision

- 1 From a low starting point, there has been a small increase in the number of Welsh-medium or bilingual learning activities in further education colleges over recent years. However, although the Welsh Government's target for 2015 has been achieved, many learners do not continue their learning through the medium of Welsh or bilingually when they transfer from school to college.
- 2 Overall, too few Welsh-speaking learners continue their studies through the medium of Welsh or bilingually in further education colleges. There is considerable variation between learning areas in the proportion of Welsh-speaking learners who follow their courses through Welsh or bilingually. This includes learning areas for which there is an increasing demand from employers for bilingual skills, such as hospitality and catering.
- 3 A few colleges have been successful in delivering courses bilingually. These colleges not only increase the opportunities to follow courses through the medium of Welsh and develop bilingual skills, but also ensure that learners who follow their courses mainly in English make progress in their Welsh language skills. However, the majority of colleges, where the number of learners who wish to learn through the medium of Welsh is low, have not given enough consideration to delivering courses bilingually in order to create a viable size for classes.
- 4 In the few cases where colleges deliver Welsh-medium or Welsh language units within English-medium courses, learners who learnt Welsh as a second language at school are given good opportunities to develop their Welsh language skills further and help meet an increasing demand from employers for these skills. In general, colleges do not do enough in this respect, nor in terms of refreshing and refining the Welsh language skills of learners from Welsh-medium schools who follow their courses through the medium of English.
- 5 Many colleges do not record information consistently and accurately about which learning activities are carried out bilingually or in Welsh. Generally, teachers and college data managers do not have a clear understanding about how their bilingual teaching approaches should be categorised. Colleges report a lack of clarity in the guidance they receive from the Welsh Government about how to categorise different bilingual teaching and learning activities. This raises doubts about the reliability of national data.

Standards of learners' Welsh language skills

- 6 In lessons, many learners who learn in Welsh or bilingually have good oral Welsh language or bilingual skills. They speak confidently and correctly, and show a good grasp of vocabulary and subject terminology. However, around a third of learners say that they are only fairly confident orally at best, despite following courses in Welsh or having attended Welsh-medium schools. Most learners who choose to present their course work in Welsh write with increasing accuracy, using a range of

vocabulary and subject terminology correctly. However, too many learners choose not to submit assignments in Welsh. Only around a third of learners feel that their Welsh has improved since their college courses began.

- 7 Generally, learners who undertake Welsh-medium units within English-medium courses make good progress, considering their linguistic background. They use Welsh vocabulary and subject-specific phrases with increasing accuracy.

Teaching and assessment

- 8 Most of the teaching in lessons that are delivered in Welsh or bilingually is good. The standard of teaching in the Welsh-medium units within English-medium courses is also generally good. In these sessions, teachers succeed in making frequent use of the Welsh language as a medium of communication and teaching.
- 9 The majority of learners who follow their courses in Welsh or bilingually do not complete their final assessments in Welsh. This has the potential to have a detrimental effect on the status of Welsh-medium provision.

Leadership

- 10 In a minority of colleges, senior leaders have a strong vision regarding promoting the Welsh language and expanding Welsh-medium or bilingual provision. In these cases, strategic plans include challenging targets and detailed improvement strategies to increase and improve this provision.
- 11 However, in the majority of colleges, leaders have not developed their Welsh language plans to the same extent. In the colleges in which there are low proportions of learners that follow their subjects or occupational areas in Welsh or bilingually, leaders do not consider that increasing this proportion is a whole-college priority. Often, schools do not share information about pupils' linguistic skills as they transfer to college, which is an obstacle to ensuring continuity and progression with regard to learning in Welsh.
- 12 Despite a few successful initiatives, colleges have not done enough to ensure that learners recognise the advantages of continuing to be taught and assessed in Welsh after they transfer to college from secondary school.

Staffing and training

- 13 A minority of colleges conduct surveys of the linguistic skills of staff regularly and implement sound recruitment policies based on this information to ensure that there are enough staff who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh. However, a shortage of Welsh-speaking staff continues to be a significant obstacle to expanding Welsh-medium provision in the majority of colleges.
- 14 A few colleges offer a wide range of in-service training on issues regarding the Welsh language and bilingualism. However, where the number of learners who wish to follow their courses in Welsh is low, colleges do not do enough to develop the bilingual teaching skills of staff.

Support and guidance

- 15 Bilingual champions, the sabbatical scheme¹, and Sgiliaith² have ensured good support for teachers and learners. Due to the work of bilingual champions, the majority of further education colleges now prepare social programmes that provide a broad variety of opportunities for learners to use Welsh outside the classroom. However, the impact of bilingual champions is less positive where they do not contribute to strategic planning processes and to reviewing progress against targets.
- 16 There is still a shortage of Welsh-speaking staff and Welsh-medium resources in the post-16 sector. A shortage of Welsh textbooks and external verifiers, along with the arrangements of awarding bodies, continues to limit Welsh-medium provision.

¹The Sabbatical Scheme is a training programme for practitioners in order to increase the supply of practitioners who are able to teach and train through the medium of Welsh in a range of pre-16 and post-16 subjects. The Scheme offers periods of intensive study, away from the classroom, in order to develop Welsh language skills and gain confidence in bilingual and Welsh-medium teaching methodologies.

²Canolfan Sgiliaith was established at Coleg Meirion-Dwyfor in 2001. The centre's aim is to promote Welsh-medium and bilingual post-16 education throughout Wales. Sgiliaith supports colleges and other providers across Wales to respond to the increasing demands for Welsh language skills.

Recommendations

Further education colleges should:

- R1 Work more effectively with secondary schools to identify Welsh-speaking learners before they transfer to college and ensure that learners have all the information about support that they need in order to allow them to choose to continue their learning in Welsh
- R2 Strengthen Welsh language strategic plans to increase the number of learners who learn in Welsh or bilingually, particularly in the occupational areas for which there is an increasing demand by employers for bilingual skills
- R3 Ensure that there are sufficient staff available in each college to provide courses in Welsh or bilingually and to support staff who wish to learn Welsh or improve their Welsh
- R4 Improve staff training on the methodology of teaching bilingually and ensure that there are sufficient resources and learning materials for Welsh-medium or bilingual courses
- R5 Ensure that information about learners' language ability, prior qualifications in Welsh and learning activities are correctly recorded on the Lifelong Learning Wales Record

The Welsh Government should:

- R6 Help colleges to improve the quality of Welsh language strategic plans, including the use of data to set challenging targets to increase the number of learners who follow their courses in Welsh or bilingually
- R7 Conduct regular reviews of the progress made by colleges against the targets in their strategic plans
- R8 Improve data collection fields, and their associated guidance, to ensure that colleges record accurate information about learners' linguistic abilities and the language of learning and assessment by activity
- R9 Develop a national strategy to raise learners' awareness of the advantages of choosing to continue to learn in Welsh when they transfer from school to college
- R10 Ensure that there are sufficient resources and learning materials for Welsh-medium or bilingual courses

Continuity and progression in Welsh-medium and bilingual learning experiences

Welsh-medium and bilingual learning activities

- 17 Further education colleges record a range of information about learners' use of Welsh and the provision of bilingual or Welsh-medium teaching and learning. This information is recorded in the Lifelong Learning Wales Record (LLWR) (Welsh Government 2016b) and communicated to the Welsh Government for funding and monitoring purposes. Colleges record information in the following LLWR fields:
- LP23 Welsh speaker indicator. Learners self-report if they are: a fluent Welsh speaker; a Welsh speaker not fluent; or not a Welsh speaker.
 - LP67 Level of highest Welsh language qualification achieved prior to learning programme. Colleges generally gather information provided by the learner about their prior attainments at enrolment.
 - LA26 Type of Welsh-medium learning. Colleges record the extent to which each learning activity for each learner is carried out in English, bilingually or in Welsh. The categories in use since 2014-2015 are as follows:
 - E1 Learning and assessment in English only.
 - B3 A small amount of Welsh-medium learning, for example use of Welsh limited to verbal communication or to a minor part of the learning activity. English only assessment. This code can be used to record situations where some Welsh is used during the learning. Minimum use of incidental Welsh is not sufficient for it to be recorded. There needs to be Welsh language interaction between assessor/lecturer/teacher and learner for it to be a meaningful use of the language.
 - B2 A significant amount of Welsh-medium learning, for example both verbal and written Welsh used in many, but not all, parts of the learning activity. Assessment mainly in English but some may also be in Welsh.
 - B1 Learning completed in a bilingual context and at least 50% of the available assessments within the learning activity completed through the medium of Welsh. The outcome may be achieved using any appropriate teaching methodology.
 - C1 Learning completed in a Welsh-medium context and all of the available assessments within the learning activity completed through the medium of Welsh.

Unless otherwise stated, this report refers to bilingual teaching and learning as any delivery in categories B1, B2 or B3.

- 18 There are some doubts about the consistency of how colleges record information for these fields and the reliability of the information they generate. For example, learners may not accurately self-report their own level of Welsh fluency (LP23) when completing an enrolment form, or they may not be aware of the definitions of fluency associated with this field. In 2014-2015, not all colleges returned reliably complete information about this field, meaning that the dataset is not accurate. The recent introduction of a field to record the highest level of highest Welsh language

qualification achieved prior to learning programme (LP67) should help to reduce the variability in learners' responses and provide a clearer position to measure learners' starting points in relation to Welsh language ability.

- 19 Colleges do not apply consistently the same processes in categorising learning activities for the field that record the type of Welsh-medium learning (LA26). Generally, teachers and college data managers do not have a clear understanding about how their bilingual teaching approaches should be categorised. For example, in some colleges, this is recorded by teachers for each learner and each learning activity. In others, it is recorded on a class by class basis.
- 20 Colleges report a lack of clarity in the guidance they receive from the Welsh Government about how to categorise different bilingual teaching and learning activities.
- 21 Nevertheless, it is possible to identify broad trends from the national data and to monitor progress against the national strategy. There has been an increase of just over two percentage points in the number of Welsh-medium or bilingual learning activities in further education colleges between 2009-2010 and 2013-2014. This increase may be attributed in part to the introduction of Welsh-medium 'language at work' units in English-medium courses, rather than an increase in Welsh-medium and bilingual vocational courses. However, in 2014-2015, there was a decrease from 8.5% to 7.2% in the total number of Welsh-medium or bilingual learning activities in further education colleges. This dip was due to revised definitions of Welsh-medium and bilingual learning for post-16. The figures over the last three years remain higher than the Welsh Government's target of 7% for 2015. However, the number of learners who study through the medium of Welsh or bilingually remains much lower than in schools. Table 2 in Appendix 2 shows the detailed pattern in the number of Welsh and bilingual learning activities over the years.
- 22 On the whole, only 10% of learners in colleges identify themselves as Welsh speakers, compared to 27% of the 16 to 19-year-old population in the 2011 Census and the 20% of the pupils studying Welsh as a first language in maintained schools in 2016. Table 4 in Appendix 2 illustrates the number of learning activities according to the medium of learning.
- 23 In all learning areas, except Independent Living Skills, fewer learners study substantially bilingually (B1) or through the medium of Welsh (C1) than report themselves as fluent in Welsh. Looking at all of the bilingual and Welsh-medium categories (B1, B2, B3, C1), in only five of the 19 learning areas does the proportion of learners studying bilingually match the proportion of learners who report that they are fluent in Welsh.
- 24 Across the learning areas, there is considerable variation in the numbers that follow courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. Nineteen per cent carry out Welsh-medium or bilingual learning activities in agriculture, horticulture and animal care, and 11% in engineering and manufacturing technologies. However, in health, public services and care, and business administration and law, only 7% and 6% of learning activities, respectively, are studied through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. These figures, in particular, are low considering the demand for bilingual skills from employers in these areas.

Models of provision

- 25 There has been a shift towards a pattern of providing courses bilingually in those colleges located in west and north-west of Wales. This supports opportunities for Welsh-speaking learners to follow their courses with significant elements using the Welsh language and to foster their bilingual skills to meet employers' needs. In addition, it is a means of ensuring that learners who choose to follow their courses mainly through the medium of English are in regular contact with the Welsh language, and are given an opportunity to build successfully on their previous achievements in the Welsh language whilst at school.
- 26 However, in the majority of colleges, there is a lack of Welsh-medium or bilingual provision for students who attended Welsh-medium secondary schools. In these cases, although learners have an opportunity to participate in useful social activities through the medium of Welsh, there is a lack of specific provision to maintain and improve their Welsh language skills as part of their courses, such as language refresher classes. The majority of learners state that they are keen to follow language refresher courses to improve their Welsh language skills, and they are worried that they will lose their linguistic skills.
- 27 In a few cases, colleges deliver Welsh-medium units on English-medium courses successfully. This offers good opportunities for learners who followed programmes of study in Welsh as a second language at school. However, in general, there is a lack of opportunities in the curriculum for learners to build on their previous achievements in Welsh as a second language.

Learner choices

- 28 Too many learners who have been taught through the medium of Welsh or bilingually at school choose not to continue to follow Welsh-medium courses at college, even where they are offered.
- 29 The Learner Voice Wales³ survey in 2014-2015 shows that 10% of learners in further education are keen to learn through the medium of Welsh or bilingually, with only 1% wishing to follow their courses through the medium of Welsh only (Welsh Government, 2015b). This is similar to the picture in previous years.

³ The survey is conducted annually by the Welsh Government. Providers receive detailed reports on the results of their surveys and they are expected to produce action plans in response to them.

Standards

Standards of Welsh language skills in Welsh-medium or bilingual sessions

- 30 Most learners have good oral Welsh language skills including, at times, the use of sophisticated syntax. Most contribute confidently throughout the sessions and express an opinion, offering reasons to support that opinion concisely. Most learners who learn through the medium of Welsh make good progress in their skills in both languages during lessons on bilingual occupational courses.
- 31 Learners are confident when answering questions and ask teachers for further information to reinforce their learning, as necessary. Most learners' presentation skills in practical sessions are developing appropriately, for example in sports training sessions or presenting their research projects in agriculture.
- 32 Standards of writing in Welsh vary from one course to the next. The majority of learners who follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually complete their written assignments in English. Most learners who choose to submit their course work in Welsh write with increasing accuracy, using a range of vocabulary and subject terminology correctly. However, a few learners have a tendency to mutate words incorrectly or make minor grammatical errors.
- 33 Most learners' translanguaging skills develop well as they undertake independent research for individual projects. Translanguaging is the use of different languages together. Learners are able to use information sources in both languages and present a summary, main points or an opinion about them in Welsh or English, as required. Most learners are able to present and discuss their research confidently.
- 34 Many learners say that they feel confident speaking Welsh. However, approximately a third of learners state that they feel fairly confident at best when speaking, although they either all follow courses through the medium of Welsh or have attended Welsh-medium schools. Only around a third of learners feel that their Welsh has improved since they began their college courses.

Standards in Welsh language skills in Welsh language units on English-medium courses

- 35 In general, most learners contribute enthusiastically to learning activities, using Welsh vocabulary and subject-specific phrases with improving accuracy over time. Most make good use of dictionaries, terminology books and computerised checking programmes to extend their vocabulary and correct their work. However, the range of sentence patterns that they use is limited and they often give relatively short responses.

Teaching and assessment

Teaching in Welsh

- 36 Nearly all teachers provide a good language model for the learners and give lively and interesting presentations. In practical lessons, they demonstrate the latest techniques in their occupational fields effectively before asking the learners to practise and emulate these techniques. In theory sessions, teachers use video clips successfully to demonstrate new techniques and to reinforce and extend the learners' learning.
- 37 In general, most teachers encourage learners successfully to be independent. Often, this is used to develop learners' translanguaging skills effectively by asking them to research topics, often in English, and then prepare presentations through the medium of Welsh.

Bilingual teaching

- 38 Nearly all teachers have sound Welsh language skills and they have a rich vocabulary in the subject that they teach. They are all good language models for the learners. Most teachers make extensive use of the Welsh language during bilingual learning sessions. By doing so, they ensure that everyone in the class understands what is being said. All tutors speak Welsh one-to-one with Welsh-speaking learners and encourage them to use the language in group discussions.
- 39 Most teachers are effective in allowing both language groups in the class opportunities to hear and see enough Welsh to be confident in using the language. This ensures that the Welsh-speaking learners use the language confidently and non-Welsh-speaking learners understand what is happening and play an active part in the lesson. However, in a few bilingual lessons, teachers repeat everything in Welsh and English and, as a result, the pace of the lessons becomes unnecessarily slow, and this hinders learners' progress. Often, teachers encourage learners regularly to use Welsh spell-checking software to check their written tasks in Welsh and to improve their language skills. On the whole, they have high expectations for the learners' use of the Welsh language during sessions. However, in a very few sessions, teachers do not challenge learners to extend their Welsh language communication skills, and they are too willing to accept answers in English.

Teaching Welsh language units

- 40 In occupational language units in Welsh on English-medium courses, most tutors make a good effort to speak Welsh with second language learners regularly throughout the session. They nurture language well and encourage learners to extend their Welsh linguistic skills. They correct the learners' language sensitively, which increases their confidence to use the Welsh language throughout the session. Most language tutors prepare good quality glossaries and lists of Welsh phrases to ensure that learners use the correct occupational terms in their learning areas.

Assessment

- 41 Nearly all teachers praise learners' efforts appropriately. In the best sessions, teachers give appropriate attention to increasing learners' confidence to use the Welsh language throughout the sessions. They correct language errors sensitively while providing them with a model of spoken language of the highest standard in their presentations and discussions.
- 42 Most teachers mark the work of learners who choose to write in Welsh positively and constructively. Appropriately, teachers choose the errors that need particular attention, for example key words for the course.
- 43 The majority of learners who follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually complete their assignments and final assessments through the medium of English. The lack of examinations and final assessments through the medium of Welsh has the potential for a detrimental effect on the status of Welsh-medium provision.

Leadership

- 44 In a minority of colleges, senior leaders have a clear vision regarding expanding Welsh-medium or bilingual provision. They have set challenging aims for expanding Welsh-medium provision in their action plans. These plans contain challenging quantitative targets, with a detailed programme of specific actions to develop provision and achieve the aims. In these colleges, the effect is a significant increase in the number of learners who follow their courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.
- 45 However, leaders in many colleges across Wales have not developed their Welsh plans to the same extent. In the further education colleges in which low proportions of learners follow their subjects or occupational areas through the medium of Welsh or bilingually, leaders do not always consider that increasing this proportion is a priority. Many colleges where Welsh-medium classes are not viable have not given enough attention to delivering courses bilingually and providing training for staff.
- 46 Only a minority of colleges make good use of a range of performance data that provides rigorous information by course or occupational area about Welsh-medium courses. These colleges use this information effectively to challenge, stimulate and make changes. However, there is great variation in the way in which colleges across Wales use data effectively to increase and measure the success of Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching and learning. There is still a great deal of confusion about recording methods and expectations, and this has a detrimental effect on stakeholders' ability to measure success and progress by using comparative data.
- 47 Recently, a few colleges have developed a joint protocol with local secondary schools, which means that, from now on, they will be able to identify Welsh speakers before they arrive at the colleges. This is a valuable contribution towards improving linguistic progression between schools and colleges. However, transition systems

between most further education colleges and Welsh-medium and bilingual secondary schools are not effective enough. Often, there is a lack of information-sharing by schools about pupils' linguistic skills as they transfer to further education colleges. This hinders the ability of those colleges to plan to improve learners' linguistic skills and expand Welsh-medium or bilingual provision to ensure continuity and progression.

- 48 An increasing number of colleges draw prospective learners' attention to learning opportunities through the medium of Welsh. However, although there are examples of useful initiatives regarding marketing the advantages of continuing to learn in Welsh or bilingually at college, providers have not succeeded in doing enough to ensure that more learners choose to do so.

Staffing and training

- 49 In general, the lack of staff who are able to teach in Welsh continues to be a significant obstacle in many colleges. This hinders greatly the ability of these colleges to increase Welsh-medium and bilingual learning opportunities. Few colleges, particularly where Welsh-medium provision is limited, have conducted surveys of their staff's language skills as a starting point for identifying training needs.
- 50 In a minority of cases, colleges have a clear code of practice for recruiting staff to maintain or increase the current proportion of Welsh speakers among the teaching staff. In these cases, leaders review regularly whether the Welsh language should be essential or desirable when appointing staff, in accordance with the objectives and targets of their Welsh language schemes. This enables them to ensure that they have enough qualified staff in the occupational areas that have been prioritised for increasing Welsh language provision.
- 51 A few further education colleges offer specific training for members of staff who are eager to improve their Welsh language skills. These colleges often take advantage of training programmes from the regional Welsh for Adults centre or internal provision within the college.
- 52 A few colleges also provide language awareness training for staff to understand the basics of the content of their Welsh language schemes, learning resources and information and communication technology resources. They also arrange special courses to raise the awareness of new members of staff for them to implement the college's Welsh language schemes. A few colleges also provide language refresher courses for their staff.
- 53 However, many staff across further education institutions in Wales who deliver Welsh-medium or bilingual courses have not regularly received additional training on the methodology of Welsh-medium or bilingual teaching.
- 54 Many further education colleges have taken advantage of the sabbatical scheme as a means of improving the Welsh language skills of their teaching staff. As a result, most members of staff who have followed these courses teach their subjects through

the medium of Welsh or bilingually. Sgiliaith also provides methodology training to enable teachers to teach bilingually in the classroom. This centre has also developed a course that is tailored specifically for managers who are responsible for learning provision to manage and promote bilingualism issues in the departments of further education colleges.

- 55 The majority of staff in colleges have not received enough training on how to explain to prospective learners from Welsh-medium secondary schools the advantages of following courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

Support and guidance

Bilingual champions

- 56 The role of bilingual champions has been central to a range of linguistic activities at a one-to-one level with learners, and to developing Welsh language provision within learning areas. They have also contributed to developing productive partnerships between colleges and Welsh-medium secondary schools in many areas and to plan Welsh-medium options for learners aged 16-19 jointly between providers as part of 14-19 Learning Pathways. The Welsh Government (2015b) and research conducted by Arad (2014) also note the impact of bilingual champions and the decision made by colleges to continue funding the role after government grant funding comes to end.
- 57 One of the clear strengths in the work of bilingual champions in colleges is the way in which they succeed in developing and expanding opportunities for learners to use the Welsh language outside the classroom. They arrange a range of Welsh-medium extra-curricular activities that enable learners to use the Welsh language.
- 58 However, there is great variation between colleges in terms of the range of the champions' responsibilities, with champions working in different ways and at different levels in the colleges. Bilingual champions who contribute at a strategic level towards devising and overseeing the colleges' Welsh language schemes have greater success in setting a strategic direction, and in ensuring that Welsh-medium provision increases and more learners take advantage of it.

Resources and learning materials

- 59 Most teachers create a good range of colourful, attractive presentations for use in their classes. The standard of Welsh in worksheets and in additional Welsh language and bilingual resources is consistently good. Often, teachers take extensive advantage of the colleges' translation departments to ensure consistency in terms of the language of specialist subjects. However, the lack of national multimedia materials and resources in Welsh-medium occupational areas is a significant obstacle in increasing the range of Welsh-medium and bilingual courses.
- 60 As a result, teachers who teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually spend a great deal of additional time preparing purposeful resources through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. Not all colleges ensure that staff who prepare Welsh-medium or bilingual courses are given enough time to prepare learning materials that are as good in terms of format as English-medium materials.

- 61 In general, there are not enough national materials available to ensure that learners are able to obtain a range of good quality Welsh-medium resources in their occupational areas. Very few of the Hwb⁴ resources are useful to learners and teachers in further education colleges. As a result, there is a great deal of pressure on individual colleges to create their own Welsh-medium materials for learners. Hwb does not have a Welsh language editor to develop high quality, purposeful resources for Welsh-medium provision in the post-16 sector.
- 62 A shortage of textbooks in Welsh, along with the arrangements of awarding bodies, continues to limit Welsh-medium provision. In some cases, learners are unable to sit examinations through the medium of Welsh in January due to the examining boards' policies. These policies only allow learners to sit their examinations through the medium of English at that time. Furthermore, there are not enough external verifiers in occupational subjects who are able to discharge their duties through the medium of Welsh.

⁴ Hwb is a Welsh Government initiative that offers digital learning tools and resources that are provided nationally for 3-19 learners in schools. Currently, unlike schools, further education colleges do not have Hwb accounts.

Appendix 1: Evidence base

The report is based on the following evidence:

1 Visits by inspectors to four further education colleges in 2014 - 2015:

Cardiff and Vale College

- Barry campus

Coleg Cambria

- Llysfasi campus
- Yale campus
- Deeside campus

Coleg Sir Gar

- Graig campus
- Gelli Aur campus

Grwp Llandrillo Menai

- Coleg Llandrillo
- Coleg Menai
 - Bangor campus
 - Llangefni campus
- Coleg Meirion Dwyfor
 - Dolgellau campus
 - Pwllheli campus

During the visits, inspectors:

- observed lessons
- interviewed principals, senior officers with responsibility for teaching through the medium of Welsh and bilingualism
- spoke to teachers and learners
- scrutinised learners' work

2 Evidence from inspections of further education colleges between 2010 and 2014

3 Analysis of the responses to the college questionnaires

4 Analysis of the responses to the learners' questionnaire

5 Analyses of the Welsh Government's LLWR post-16 data

6 Telephone interviews with college data managers

Appendix 2: Data evidence

Table 1: All-Wales targets for increasing the number of learners aged 16-19 who study subjects through the medium of Welsh in schools, colleges and work-based learning

Indicators	Baseline 2007-2008 WM+B**	Targets	
		2015 WM+B**	2020 WM+B **
Learners' learning activities by medium of teaching (LA26)*			
Schools	14.9%	18%	20%
Further education institutions	4.7%	7%	10%
Work-based learning	1.4%	2.5%	4%

Source: Welsh Government (2015a)

* excluding Welsh language education

** WM = Welsh-medium, B = Bilingual

Table 2: Welsh-medium (WM) and bilingual (B) learning experiences for learners aged 16-19 in schools, colleges and work-based learning

Student learning activities by medium of teaching (LA26)*	2009-2010** WM+B	2010-2011 WM+B	2011-2012 WM+B	2012/13 WM+B	2013-2014 WM+B	2014-2015*** WM+B
Schools	17.1%	21.0%	17.4%	20.1%	20.5%	20.4%
Further education institutions	6.2%	5.7%	6.7%	8.4%	8.5%	7.2%
Work-based learning	1.5%	3.0%	3.9%	3.6%	3.0%	6.7%

Source: Welsh Government (2016c)

* Excluding Welsh Language Learning

** Prior to 2010-2011, data for work-based learning provision delivered by further education institutions was categorised under 'Further education institutions'. From 2010-2011 onwards, this data has been categorised under 'Work-based learning'.

*** The Lifelong Learning Wales Record field (LA26) for Welsh-medium and bilingual learning post-16 has been revised and became operational in 2014-2015. Now, the learning is recorded according to the medium of learning and the language of assessment of individuals, rather than the language of learning and assessment for the whole classroom cohort. As a result there has been a drop from 8.5% in 2013-2014 to 7.2% in 2014-2015 data.

The following table shows the percentage of Welsh speakers in each local authority in Wales, along with the percentage of pupils of statutory school age who are studying Welsh as a first language:

Table 3: Distribution of Welsh speakers in Wales and statutory school aged pupils who are educated through the medium of Welsh by local authority

Local authority	Percentage of the population (age 3+) able to speak Welsh, Census 2011	Percentage of statutory school age pupils taught Welsh as a first language, PLASC 2016 (a)
Ynys Môn	57%	70%
Gwynedd	65%	92%
Conwy	27%	22%
Denbighshire	25%	23%
Flintshire	13%	6%
Wrexham	13%	11%
Powys	19%	16%
Ceredigion	47%	71%
Pembrokeshire	19%	18%
Carmarthenshire	44%	49%
Swansea	11%	13%
Neath Port Talbot	15%	15%
Bridgend	10%	8%
The Vale of Glamorgan	11%	12%
Cardiff	11%	14%
Rhondda Cynon Taf	12%	19%
Merthyr Tydfil	9%	7%
Caerphilly	11%	15%
Blaenau Gwent	8%	3%
Torfaen	10%	12%
Monmouthshire	10%	3%
Newport	9%	3%
Wales	19%	20%

Sources: Census 2011, Office for National Statistics and Welsh Government 2016a

(a) includes pupils from maintained primary, secondary and all age schools.

Although the catchment area of each college does not correspond to local authority boundaries, the table is useful for providing a rough benchmark. It is a means of measuring how successfully colleges ensure continuity and progression in Welsh-medium education based on the situation in schools.

Table 4: Learning activities by learners aged 16-19, by various indicators related to Welsh, 2014-2015

	Total number of learning activities	Percentage of learning activities by learners who....		Percentage of all learning activities with each type of delivery.. (a)				
		.. identify themselves as Welsh speakers (LP23)	.. have a qualification at Level 1 or above in Welsh 1st Language (LP67)	Bilingual				Welsh (C1)
				B3	B2	B1	Total	
Health, Public Services and Care	10,935	8%	7%	3%	1%	4%	7%	0%
Leisure, Travel and Tourism	4,960	9%	8%	2%	0%	5%	7%	0%
Information and Communication Technology	4,305	7%	6%	3%	1%	1%	5%	0%
Hospitality and Catering	3,260	16%	12%	4%	1%	5%	10%	0%
Retailing and Customer Service	485	14%	10%	0%	0%	3%	3%	0%
Science and Mathematics	11,265	7%	6%	-	-	3%	4%	0%
Agriculture, Horticulture and Animal Care	1,975	14%	13%	6%	3%	7%	15%	4%
Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies	6,500	12%	10%	2%	-	9%	11%	-
Construction, Planning and the Built Environment	4,685	11%	7%	5%	-	6%	11%	0%
Hair and Beauty	2,650	8%	7%	1%	0%	2%	4%	0%
Performing Arts	2,540	8%	8%	1%	0%	7%	8%	0%
Art and Design	7,220	8%	6%	2%	1%	2%	5%	0%
History, Philosophy and Theology	4,610	7%	6%	0%	0%	2%	2%	0%
Social Sciences	2,770	7%	7%	0%	0%	3%	3%	0%
Languages, Literature and Culture	8,675	8%	6%	4%	-	8%	12%	3%
Education and Training	410	6%	5%	0%	0%	2%	2%	0%
Independent Living Skills	620	10%	2%	0%	0%	17%	17%	0%
Foundation for Work	37,725	12%	9%	3%	1%	6%	10%	-
Business, Administration and Law	6,510	10%	9%	-	1%	4%	6%	0%
Total learning activities	122,100	10%	8%	2%	1%	5%	8%	-

Source: LLWR 2014-2015 – post-16 database, Welsh Government (2016b)

(a) For definitions see page 6.

‘-’ refers to a percentage rounding to zero but not actually zero, where the numerator is based on a number of learning activities less than 5 or if the total number of learning activities is less than 5.

References

Arad (2014) *Evaluation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy: A study of the work of the Bilingual Champions in Further Education*. [Online]. Available from: <http://gov.wales/docs/caecd/research/2014/140925-welsh-medium-education-strategy-bilingual-champions-en.pdf> [Accessed 2 November 2016]

Office of National Statistics (2011) *2011 Census: Welsh speakers by local authority, gender and detailed age groups*. [Online]. Available from: <https://stats.wales.gov.wales/Catalogue/Welsh-Language/WelshSpeakers-by-LocalAuthority-Gender-DetailedAgeGroups-2011Census> [Accessed 4 August 2016].

Welsh Assembly Government (2010) *Welsh-medium Education Strategy*. [Online]. Available from: <http://gov.wales/docs/dcells/publications/100420welshmediumstrategyen.pdf> [Accessed 1st November 2016]

Welsh Government (2014) *Lifelong Learning Wales Record 13-14*. Unpublished.
Welsh Government, Department for Education and Skills (2015a) *Welsh-medium Education Strategy: Annual report 2014-15*. Cardiff: Welsh Government. [Online]. Available from: <http://gov.wales/docs/dcells/publications/150715-welsh-medium-annual-report-en.pdf> [Accessed 4 August 2016].

Welsh Government (2015b) *Post-16 Learner Voice Wales survey results, 2015*. SDR 58/2015. [Online]. Available from: <http://gov.wales/docs/statistics/2015/150421-post-16-learner-voice-wales-survey-2015-en.pdf> [Accessed 4 August 2016].

Welsh Government (2016a) *Pupil Level Annual School Census (PLASC)*. Unpublished

Welsh Government (2016b) *Lifelong Learning Wales Record user support manual for learning providers (XML) 2016/17*. [Online]. Available from <http://gov.wales/topics/educationandskills/learningproviders/datacollection/?skip=1&lang=en> [Accessed 28 October 2016]

Welsh Government, Department for Education and Skills (2016c) *Welsh-medium Education Strategy: Annual report 2015-16*. Cardiff: Welsh Government. [Online]. Available from: <http://gov.wales/topics/welshlanguage/publications/welsh-language-strategy-annual-report/?skip=1&lang=en> [Accessed 31 October 2016]